# CORRECTIONS

# Cost effectiveness of telehealth for patients with long term conditions (Whole Systems Demonstrator telehealth questionnaire study): nested economic evaluation in a pragmatic, cluster randomised controlled trial

The authors of this paper, Catherine Henderson and colleagues, have told us of some transcription errors they made in the tables (*BMJ* 2013;346:f1035, doi:10.1136/bmj.f1035). In table 1⇓ the raw differences for use of "GP (home)", "GP (surgery)", and "GP (telephone)" services are incorrect. In table 5⇓ there are errors in the QALY value for the primary outcome in the telehealth group; the ICER for CESD-10; and the footnote text. There are also errors scattered throughout table 4⇓. The three corrected tables are here.

Cite this as: *BMJ* 2013;346:f2065

© BMJ Publishing Group Ltd 2013

# Tables

**Table 1**| **[CORRECTED VERSION] Self reported service use (contacts) and unit costs to be applied, across treatment groups at 12 month follow-up**

| Service use item | Mean (SE) contacts* | | Between group difference | | Unit cost (£) | Unit |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Usual care (n=431) | Telehealth (n=538) | Raw (£) | Standardised (%)† | | |
| **Hospital use** | | | | | | |
| Emergency department | 0.38 (0.07) | 0.23 (0.04) | −0.15‡ | −13.7 | 103.00-133.00 | Per attendance[26] |
| Inpatient bed days | 1.23 (0.24) | 0.98 (0.22) | −0.25 | −5.0 | 116.00-1657.00 | Per day[26] |
| Day hospital and other day attendances | 0.51 (0.12) | 0.39 (0.1) | −0.13 | −5.4 | 156.00-1496.00 | Per attendance[26] |
| Outpatient attendances | 1.26 (0.13) | 1.07 (0.08) | −0.18 | −8.3 | 23.00-306.00 | Per attendance[26] |
| **Community health services/primary care** | | | | | | |
| Paramedic | 0.18 (0.04) | 0.13 (0.02) | −0.05 | −8.0 | 192.00 | Per visit[24] |
| Community matron (visit) | 0.76 (0.15) | 0.7 (0.14) | −0.06 | −1.9 | 1.31, 38.00 | Per minute, per visit[24] |
| Community matron (telephone) | 0.2 (0.04) | 0.38 (0.1) | 0.18 | 10.4 | 1.28 | Per minute[24] |
| Community or district nurse (visit) | 0.73 (0.26) | 1.26 (0.74) | 0.53 | 4.2 | 1.13, 24.00 | Per minute,[24] per visit[24] |
| Community or district nurse (telephone) | 0.14 (0.06) | 0.24 (0.07) | 0.10 | 6.8 | 0.52 | Per minute[24] |
| Practice nurse | 1.5 (0.15) | 1.26 (0.11) | −0.24 | −9.3 | 0.52 | Per minute[24] |
| Night nurse | 0 | 0.01 (0.01) | 0.01 | 6.1 | 0.50 | Per minute[24] |
| Specialist nurse | 0.69 (0.1) | 0.64 (0.08) | −0.05 | −2.6 | 0.95-1.31 | Per minute[24] |
| Physiotherapist or occupational therapist | 0.7 (0.3) | 0.29 (0.08) | −0.41 | −10.9 | 0.65 | Per minute[24] |
| GP (home) | 0.37 (0.07) | 0.23 (0.07) | −0.13 | −11.1 | 4.00, 94.00 | Per minute,[24] per visit |
| GP (surgery) | 1.69 (0.09) | 1.7 (0.1) | 0.01 | 0.7 | 2.40, 28.00 | Per minute, per visit[24] |
| GP (telephone) | 0.52 (0.07) | 0.42 (0.04) | −0.10 | −10.6 | 17.00 | Per consultation[24] |
| Dentist | 0.42 (0.06) | 0.45 (0.05) | 0.03 | 3.2 | 86.85 | Contact[26] |
| Chiropodist | 0.61 (0.13) | 0.6 (0.11) | −0.01 | −0.4 | 35.37 | Contact[26] |
| Optician | 0.48 (0.09) | 0.37 (0.04) | −0.11 | −8.4 | 20.26 | Per eye test[27] |
| **Community mental health** | | | | | | |
| Psychiatrist | 0.02 (0.01) | 0.02 (0.01) | −0.00 | −0.2 | 4.72 | Per minute[24] |
| Mental health nurse | 0.02 (0.01) | 0.03 (0.02) | 0.01 | 3.6 | 0.83 | Per minute[24] |
| **Community care services** | | | | | | |
| Social worker | 0.35 (0.23) | 0.16 (0.05) | −0.19 | −6.0 | 0.92 | Per minute[24] |
| Day and evening care/help at home | 6.36 (1.4) | 4.98 (1.5) | −1.38 | −4.3 | 0.42 | Per minute[24] |
| Paid night carer | 0.19 (0.11) | 0.4 (0.24) | 0.21 | 4.9 | 0.50 | Per minute[24] |
| Meals on wheels | 0.45 (0.26) | 0.65 (0.46) | 0.20 | 2.3 | 5.00 | Per meal[24] |
| Major and minor adaptations | 0.07 (0.02) | 0.08 (0.02) | 0.01 | 3.5 | 1.50-455 | Per adaptation[24] |
| Equipment (such as mobility, ADL) | 0.17 (0.04) | 0.19 (0.03) | 0.02 | 2.2 | 0.20-97.5 | Per item[24,28,29] |
| **Care home respite** | | | | | | |
| Days | 0.02 (0.02) | 0.03 (0.03) | 0.00 | 0.5 | 63.72-70.57 | Per day[24] |
| **Day services** | | | | | | |
| Day care and other day attendances | 0.59 (0.18) | 0.44 (0.16) | −0.15 | −4.1 | 36.00-155.82 | Per attendance[24,26,30,31] |
| **Drug treatment** | | | | | | |
| No of drugs | 8.57 (0.23) | 8.64 (0.2) | 0.07 | 1.7 | Various | Various[32] |

£1=€1.14; $1.49. Unit costs were applied to the last three months before 12 month follow-up.

**Table 1 (continued)**

| | Mean (SE) contacts* | | Between group difference | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Service use item | Usual care (n=431) | Telehealth (n=538) | Raw (£) | Standardised (%)† | Unit cost (£) | Unit |

SE=standard error; ADL=activities of daily living.

*Mean contacts for all participants who completed the questionnaire within each treatment group.

†Standardised difference=difference between group means divided by standard deviation of the total sample.

‡P<0.05, *t* test.

**Table 5| [CORRECTED VERSION] Differences in costs\* and effect between treatment groups at 12 month follow-up, from net benefit analyses. Data are mean (95% confidence interval) unless otherwise stated**

| | Usual care (n=431) | Telehealth (n=534) | Between group difference or ICER (95% CI) |
|---|---|---|---|
| **Primary outcome** | | | |
| QALY (raw mean difference)† | 0.549 (0.52 to 0.577) | 0.560 (0.535 to 0.585) | 0.012 (−0.026 to 0.049) |
| Cost (£; raw mean difference)† | 5559 (4752 to 6366) | 6384 (5688 to 7081) | 826 (−689 to 2340) |
| QALY (adjusted mean difference)§‡ | — | — | 0.012 |
| Cost (£; adjusted mean difference)§ | 5401 (4498 to 6305) | 6511 (5905 to 7116) | 1110 (−1 to 2220) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 92 000 (0 to undefined) |
| Costs excluding project management costs (£) | | | |
| Raw mean difference† | 5555 (4748 to 6362) | 6193 (5491 to 6895) | 637 (−427 to 1702) |
| Adjusted mean difference§ | 5395 (4492 to 6297) | 6322 (5712 to 6933) | 928 (−184 to 2040) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 79 000 (undefined) |
| **Sensitivity analyses** | | | |
| Equipment prices reduced by 50% | | | |
| Cost (£; adjusted mean difference)§ | 5395 (4492 to 6298) | 6174 (5566 to 6782) | 779 (−333 to 1890) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 68 000 (undefined) |
| Equipment prices reduced by 80% | | | |
| Cost (£; adjusted mean difference)§ | 5391 (4488 to 6295) | 5972 (5362 to 6582) | 580 (−532 to 1693) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 52 000 (undefined) |
| Operating at increased capacity | | | |
| Cost (£; adjusted mean difference)§ | 5395 (4491 to 6299) | 6034 (5430 to 6638) | 639 (−471 to 1749) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 57 000 (undefined) |
| Operating at increased capacity and equipment prices reduced by 50% | | | |
| Cost (£; adjusted mean difference)§ | 5389 (4486 to 6293) | 5697 (5090 to 6304) | 308 (−803 to 1419) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 31 000 (undefined) |
| Operating at increased capacity and equipment prices reduced by 80% | | | |
| Cost (£; adjusted mean difference)§ | 5386 (4482 to 6289) | 5495 (4886 to 6104) | 109 (−1002 to 1221) |
| ICER (£ per QALY)§¶ | — | — | 12 000 (undefined) |
| **Secondary outcomes** | | | |
| ICECAP-O | | | |
| Raw mean difference† | 0.751 (0.734 to 0.768) | 0.766 (0.75 to 0.781) | 0.014 (−0.011 to 0.031) |
| Adjusted mean difference§‡ | — | — | 0.012 |
| ICER (£)§¶ | — | — | 98 000 (8000 to undefined) |
| Brief STAI | | | |
| Raw mean difference† | 11.495 (11.093 to 11.896) | 10.694 (10.347 to 11.04) | −0.801 (−1.327 to −0.275) |
| Adjusted mean difference§‡\*\* | — | — | −0.762 |
| ICER (£)§¶ | — | — | 27 000 (1000 to 86 000) |
| CESD-10 | | | |
| Raw mean difference† | 10.506 (9.882 to 11.13) | 9.725 (9.17 to 10.281) | −0.781 (−1.613 to 0.052) |
| Adjusted mean difference§‡††† | — | — | −0.639 |
| ICER (£)§¶ | — | — | 9000 (0 to 160 000) |

£1=€1.14; $1.49.

\*Annual equivalent costs.

†Cases for which costs data at baseline were available.

‡Derived from slope of net monetary benefit line.

§From net benefit analyses, data adjusted for baseline costs, baseline outcome, site, demographic covariates (age, sex, ethnicity, IMD, number of chronic conditions, index condition).

¶Rounded to nearest 1000.

\*\*Retransformed to original scale to enable comparison with raw mean difference; transformed mean=0.042.

**Table 5 (continued)**

| | Usual care (n=431) | Telehealth (n=534) | Between group difference or ICER (95% CI) |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |

††Retransformed to original scale to enable comparison with raw mean difference; transformed mean=0.128.

**Table 4| [CORRECTED VERSION] Baseline characteristics of participants with available baseline economic data, at baseline and 12 month follow-up**

| | Total baseline sample | | | | Participants completing 12 month follow-up study instruments | | | | Participants not completing 12 month follow-up | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | Difference | | | | Difference | | | | Difference | |
| | UC (n=728) | TH (n=841) | Raw (£) | Stand (%)* | UC (n=431) | TH (n=534) | Raw (£) | Stand (%)* | UC (n=297) | TH (n=302) | Raw (£) | Stand (%)* |
| Age (years) | 70.6 (11.8) | 70.1 (11.8) | −0.46 | −4.0 | 70.1 (11.66) | 70.0 (10.71) | −0.12 | −1.1 | 71.3 (11.93) | 70.5 (13.48) | −0.78 | −6.1 |
| Women (%) | 40 (n=290) | 41 (n=347) | 1.4 | 2.9 | 37.6 (n=162) | 41.6 (n=222) | 3.9 | 8.1 | 43 (n=128) | 41 (n=124) | −2.0 | −4.1 |
| IMD (score)§¶ | 28.6 (13.8) | 27.7 (15) | −0.87 | −6.0 | 27.7 (13.65) | 26.1 (14.3) | −1.60 | −12.0 | 29.8 (13.91) | 30.6 (15.75) | 0.72 | 4.9 |
| Group 1 (%)§ | 17.9 (n=130) | 25.6 (n=215) | 7.7‡ | 18.4 | 18.9 (n=81) | 28.2 (n=151) | 9.1‡ | 21.9 | 16.5 (n=49) | 21.2 (n=64) | 4.7 | 12.0 |
| Group 2 (%)§ | 22.7 (n=165) | 16.8 (n=141) | −5.8‡ | −14.7 | 24.5 (n=106) | 17.6 (n=94) | −6.8‡ | −16.9 | 19.9 (n=59) | 15.2 (n=46) | −4.6 | −12.2 |
| Group 3 (%)§ | 17 (n=124) | 18.4 (n=155) | 1.4 | 3.7 | 18.4 (n=79) | 19 (n=101) | 0.6 | 1.5 | 15.2 (n=45) | 17.5 (n=53) | 2.4 | 6.5 |
| Group 4 (%)§ | 23.1 (n=168) | 19.5 (n=164) | −3.7 | −8.8 | 20.2 (n=87) | 20.4 (n=109) | 0.1 | 0.5 | 27.3 (n=81) | 17.9 (n=54) | −9.4‡ | −22.5 |
| Group 5 (%)§** | 19.4 (n=141) | 19.7 (n=166) | 0.4 | 0.9 | 18.1 (n=78) | 14.8 (n=79) | −3.3 | −8.9 | 21.2 (n=63) | 28.1 (n=85) | 6.9† | 16.1 |
| Index condition (%) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| COPD | 33.5 (n=244) | 39.7 (n=334) | 6.1† | 12.8 | 32.5 (n=140) | 43.4 (n=232) | 11.1‡ | 22.5 | 35 (n=104) | 32.8 (n=99) | −2.2 | −4.7 |
| Heart failure | 37.8 (n=275) | 31.3 (n=263) | −6.5‡ | −13.7 | 40.6 (n=175) | 33.1 (n=177) | −7.8† | −15.5 | 33.7 (n=100) | 28.5 (n=86) | −5.2 | −11.2 |
| Diabetes†† | 28.7 (n=209) | 29 (n=244) | −0.3 | 0.7 | 26.9 (n=116) | 23.4 (n=125) | −3.4 | −8.1 | 31.3 (n=93) | 38.7 (n=117) | 7.4 | 15.6 |
| No of comorbidities | 2 (1.9) | 1.8 (1.8) | −0.18 | −9.7 | 2 (1.9) | 1.8 (1.8) | −0.22 | −12.0 | 2.1 (1.8) | 2 (1.8) | −0.09 | −4.9 |
| Baseline costs (£) | 1276 (1628) | 1244 (1687) | −32 | −1.9 | 1096 (1408) | 1172 (1620) | 92 | 5.0 | 1536 (1875) | 1341 (1751) | −195 | −10.7 |
| WSD site (%) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Site 1 | 32.1 (n=234) | 30.4 (n=256) | −1.7 | −1.9 | 30.6 (n=132) | 32.6 (n=174) | 1.8 | 4.2 | 34.3 (n=102) | 26.8 (n=81) | −7.5† | −16.3 |
| Site 2 | 38.9 (n=283) | 40.7 (n=342) | 1.8 | 2.0 | 42.7 (n=184) | 44.2 (n=236) | 1.3 | 3.0 | 33.3 (n=99) | 34.8 (n=105) | 1.4 | 3.0 |
| Site 3‡‡ | 29 (n=211) | 28.9 (n=243) | −0.2 | −0.2 | 26.7 (n=115) | 23.2 (n=124) | −3.1 | -8.0 | 32.3 (n=96) | 38.4 (n=116) | 6.1 | 12.7 |
| White British ethnicity (%)§ | 86.3 (n=628) | 86.9 (n=731) | 0.6 | 1.7 | 87.5 (n=377) | 89.5 (n=478) | 2.0 | 6.4 | 84.5 (n=251) | 82.9 (n=250) | −1.6 | −4.3 |

£1=€1.14; $1.49. Data are mean (standard deviation) or proportion (%) and no of patients.

UC=usual care; TH=telehealth; Stand=standardised difference; COPD=chronic obstructive pulmonary disease.

*Standardised difference=difference between group means divided by standard deviation of the total sample.

†P<0.05 on z test of proportions.

‡P<0.01 on z test of proportions.

§Imputed data.

¶Difference between means of TH group sample at baseline and 12 month follow-up: P<0.05, t=2.09 (unpaired *t* test).

**Difference between proportions of patients in TH group at baseline and 12 month follow-up: z=2.34, P<0.05.

††Difference between proportions of patients in TH group at baseline and 12 month follow-up: z=2.29, P<0.05.

‡‡Difference between proportions of patients in TH group at baseline and 12 month follow-up: z=2.32, P<0.05.